Household Income and Children Exercise Frequency: Blacks' Diminished Returns

Shervin Assari^{1*}, Shanika Boyce², Mohsen Bazargan^{1,3} and Cleopatra H Caldwell^{4,5}

¹Department of Family Medicine, Charles R. Drew University, Los Angeles, CA 90059, USA

²Department of Pediatrics, Charles R. Drew University, Los Angeles, CA 90059, USA

³Department of Family Medicine, University of California Los Angeles (UCLA), Los Angeles, CA 90095, USA

⁴Department of Health Behavior and Health Education, University of Michigan, Ann Arbor, MI USA

⁵Center for Research on Ethnicity, Culture, and Health (CRECH), School of Public Health, University of Michigan, Ann Arbor, MI 48104, USA

Abstract

Background: Based on the Marginalization-related Diminished Returns (MDRs) framework, a wide array of socioeconomic status (SES) indicators including but not limited to household income tend to show weaker effects for members of marginalized social groups. Limited knowledge exists on MDRs of household income on children exercise frequency.

Aims: Built on the MDRs framework, we tested the hypothesis of whether the effect of household income on exercise frequency differs for Black than White children. We hypothesized that: 1) there is a positive association between household income and exercise frequency for American households.

Methods: In this cross-sectional study, data came from wave one of the Adolescent Brain Cognitive Development (ABCD) study which included 8027 non-Hispanic Black or White American children between ages 9 and 10 years old. The predictor was household income. The outcome was children exercise frequency. Linear regression was used for data analysis.

Results: According to our pooled sample regression, household income was positively associated with children exercise frequency. We found a significant interaction between household income and race, suggesting that the positive association between household income and exercise frequency was weaker for Black than White children.

Conclusions: Diminished returns of household income on children's exercise may explain poor health of high SES Black children. That is, a smaller boosting effect of household income on changing health behaviors for Blacks than Whites may be one of many mechanisms that deteriorate health of high SES Black children. Not all racial disparities in health are due to SES but also diminished marginal returns of socioeconomic status indicators such as household income for the members of marginalized and racialized communities. Research should study how the context in which Black families live, play, and work contributes to low exercise frequency of high SES Black children.

Keywords: African Americans • Blacks • Maternal health • Socioeconomic status • Income • Exercise

Introduction

A wide range of socioeconomic status (SES) indicators such as household income are strong determinants of health behaviors such as exercise frequency [1-5]. Children and adults with higher SES show higher level of exercise [6-9]. The health effect of household income is frequently shown, suggesting that household income may be among the most robust and salient determinants of health and health behaviors [10,11]. Income may in fact be one of the reasons some other SES indicators such as education promote exercise and health [12,13].

How SES indicators such as income impact health behaviors such as exercise, however, may depend on social context and demographic factors [14]. In other terms, the effects of SES indicators such as income on exercise and other health behaviors depend on race and place, suggesting that race, resources, place, and context may interact in how they shape populations' and individuals' health behaviors [15]. This may be particularly true for the effects of income, because what people can purchase and what families can do with their income differ across populations and places [16,17]. In other words, if because of residential segregation high income people would still be less able to walk and exercise, then income would show diminished

*Address for Correspondence: Shervin Assari, Department of Family Medicine, Charles R. Drew University, Los Angeles, CA 90059, USA, Tel: +1-734-858-8333; E-mail: assari@umich.edu

Copyright: © 2021 Assari S, et al. This is an open-access article distributed under the terms of the Creative Commons Attribution License, which permits unrestricted use, distribution, and reproduction in any medium, provided the original author and source are credited.

Received 11 August 2020; Accepted 16 March 2021; Published 23 March 2021

effects on exercise frequency of certain populations living under residential segregation [18].

As shown recently by a growing body of research [19,20], SES indicators such household income may not similarly impact health and behaviors of Black and White families [21]. For parents themselves, SES indicators such as household income better promote exercise of Whites than Blacks [22]. Similarly, SES shows diminished effects on delaying childbearing [23], place of living [24], stress [25], living conditions [26], economic well-being [27], and health [28] for Blacks than Whites. In one study, high-SES Black women in predominantly White areas had the highest rate of low birth weight (LBW) deliveries (14.5%), while high-SES Black women who were residing in predominantly Black neighborhoods had the lowest rate of LBW deliveries (4.0%) [15]. Thus, whether a SES indicator serve as a risk or protective factor depends on many intertwined social factors such as race and social context [29]. Any social identity that can be a proxy of how individuals or groups are treated by the society, and how they can navigate their resources, can be a source of marginalization, and any form of marginalization can potentially hinder the marginalized group against leveraging their available resources to secure measurable and tangible health outcomes [23].

Research has recently proposed Marginalization-related Diminished Returns (MDRs) as a neglected cause of racial inequalities in high SES families [19,20]. According to the MDRs literature, SES resources such as household income, show weaker effects for Black than White families [19,20]. As a result of these MDRs, SES generates fewer positive health outcomes for children who are Black than White [19,20]. Thus, we observe worse than expected economic, behavioral, and health outcomes for children from highly educated Black families; a pattern not seen for White families [30-32]. While household income generates fewer health outcomes across domains for Black than White individuals [33,34], we are unaware of any studies on racial variation in the effects of household income (e.g., MDRs) on exercise

frequency. In multiple studies in adults, SES indictors such as household income and education showed weaker effects on exercise [22], tobacco use [28], alcohol use [35,36], and diet [37] for Black than White adults. However, all these studies have had a focus on adults not children. Thus, additional studies on MDRs of household income on exercise frequency of children would be a unique contribution to the literature. These MDRs hold for a wide range of marginalizing identities [38-40], however, they are best described for Black people [41].

Aims: With MDRs being historically neglected, the research community has only recently begun to acknowledge that SES indictors may also become a source of inequalities and disparities [19,20]. To expand the past work on differential effects of SES on physical activity of Black and White adults [22], this study was performed with two aims: First, to test the effect of household income on children exercise frequency, and second, to compare this effect between Black and White children. We hypothesized a positive association between household income and exercise frequency (hypothesis 1), however, we expected weaker effects of household income on children exercise frequency for Blacks than Whites (hypothesis 2). Support for our hypothesis 2 would propose that Black children would have a poor physical activity, regardless of their household income, which would partially explain why high SES and middle-class Black children still suffer poor health.

Methods

Design and settings

This was an analysis of the existing data from the Adolescent Brain Cognitive Development (ABCD) study [42-46]. This was a cross-sectional analysis of the ABCD data. ABCD is a national, state-of-the-art brain imaging study of children's brain development [42,47].

Participants and Sampling

In the ABCD, participants were selected across multiple cities across various states in the US. This sample was predominantly from US school systems. The recruitment catchment area of the ABCD, which was composed of 21 participating sites, encompasses over 20% of the entire United States population of 9-10-year-old children. The ABCD applied a closely monitored sampling and recruitment process, which is described here [42,47], to ensure that the sample is random and representative. Such efforts of local randomization yielded a final overall ABCD sample that is a close approximation of the US national sociodemographic factors. These sociodemographic factors include race and ethnicity, age, sex, SES, and urbanicity. The SES target in the ABCD has two sources: 1) the American Community Survey (ACS) and 2) annual 3rd and 4th-grade school enrollment. The ABCD sample and sampling are well described here [48]. The first is a large-scale survey of about 3.5 million households conducted annually by the US Census. The second data are maintained by the National Center for Education Statistics (NCES), affiliated with the US Department of Education.

Analytical sample

Our analysis included 8027 non-Hispanic Black or White 9-10 children who had data on exercise frequency. We needed all our participants to have data on race, household income, family marital status, and exercise frequency.

Variables

The study variables included demographic factors (age and sex), SES indicators (household income), family marital status, as well as exercise frequency (a three-item measure).

Outcome

Exercise frequency. The following three items were used to measure exercise frequency [49]. (1) "During the past 7 days, on how many days were you physically active for a total of at least 60 minutes per day? Add up all the time you spent in any kind of physical activity that increased your heart rate and made you breathe hard some of the time", (2) "On how many of the

Page 2 of 7

past 7 days did you do exercises to strengthen or tone your muscles, such as push-ups, sit-ups, or weight lifting?", and (3) "In an average week when you are in school, on how many days do you go to physical education (PE) class?" All responses were all on 0/7 scale. A score was calculated as the sum of the exercise engagement. The total score ranged from 0 to 7, with a higher score indicative of higher exercise frequency.

Moderator

Race. A self-identified variable, race was a categorical variable: 1 for Black and 0 for White (reference category).

Independent Variable

Household income: Household income, a continuous measure, ranged from 1 to 10, where a higher score indicated a higher level of household income. The item read as "What is your total combined household income for the past 12 months? This should include income (before taxes and deductions) from all sources, wages, rent from properties, social security, disability and veteran's benefits, unemployment benefits, workman". Responses included 1 = Less than \$5,000; 2 = \$5,000; 3 = \$12,000; 4 = \$16,000; 5 = \$25,000; 6 = \$35,000; 7 = \$50,000; 8 = \$75,000; 9 = \$100,000; 10 = \$200,000.

Confounders

Age, sex, and family structure were the covariates. Parents reported children's age. Sex was 1 for male and 0 for female. Family structure was 1 for married and 0 for other.

Data Analysis

The SPSS statistical package 23.0 (IBM Corporation, Armonk, NY, USA) was used for our data analysis. Mean, standard deviation (SD), frequency, and relative frequency (%) were reported at the first step. To perform multivariable analyses, four multiple linear regressions were performed. Our first two models were performed in the pooled sample. Model 1 was performed without our interaction term. Model 2 also included an interaction term between race and household income. Model 3 and Model 4 were performed in Whites and Blacks, respectively. In all models, exercise frequency was the outcome. These models controlled for age, sex, and marital status. Regression coefficient (b), standard error, 95% CI, and p-value, and were reported for each model. To test our moderation hypothesis, we applied a regression model with the pooled sample with an interaction term as suggested by Aiken, West, and Reno [50]. We also split the sample by race and ran regressions separately in both groups. Both these approaches were used to test if the b coefficients were significantly different in White and Black children.

Ethical Aspect

Although the ABCD study protocol was approved by the Institutional Review Board (IRB) of the University of California, San Diego (UCSD) and many other institutions [47], and while children and parents gave assent and consent, our study was exempt from a full review.

Results

Descriptive data

Table 1 described the children both overall and by race. The current analysis included an overall sample of 8027, 9-10 years old children who were either White (n=5927; 73.8%) or Black (n=2100; 26.2%).

Table 1 also presents the summary of comparison of Black and White participants. As shown in this table, Black and White participants did not differ in age or sex, however, they did differ in marital status and household income. Compared to White children, Black children were less likely to be from married families and had lower levels of household income. Exercise was not different between Black and White children.

Multivariate analysis

Table 2 shows the results of two linear regression models in the overall (pooled) sample. Model 1 (Main Effect Model) showed a boosting effect of household income on children exercise frequency. Model 2 (Interaction Model) showed an interaction term between race with household income on psychosis spectrum symptoms, suggesting that the positive association between household income and exercise frequency is weaker for Black children relative to their White counterparts.

Multivariate analysis

Table 3 summarizes the results of two linear regression models by race/ ethnicity. Model 3 showed positive association between household income and exercise frequency in White children. Model 4 showed no association between household income and children exercise frequency in Black families.

Discussion

We showed that: (a) overall, high household income increases children

exercise frequency, and (b) high household income better increases children's exercise frequency in White than Black families.

This is the first paper that documents MDRs of household income on exercise frequency of Black children in the US. Thus, while similar results are reported for other health outcomes, the unique contribution of this paper is to expand MDRs as a mechanism behind low physical activity and sedentary lifestyle of high-income Black children in the US.

We found that while children from high-income families more frequently engage in exercise, this effect is less robust for Black than White families. That means, while high income White children report the highest levels of physical activity, Black children from high- and low- income families report low exercise frequency. This result is an indicator of MDRs of household income on children exercise frequency.

The existing research has shown MDRs of household income and parental education. MDRs of household income is reported for impulse control [51], school function [34], and school bonding [52]. Similarly, Black children from high SES families remain at high risk of chronic diseases [17] such as ADHD

	•		. ,					
	All		Whites		Blacks			
	n	%	n	%	n	%		
Race								
White	5927	73.8	5927	100.0	-	-		
Black	2100	26.2	-	-	2100	100.0		
Sex								
Female	3815	47.5	2786	47.0	1029	49.0		
Male	4212	52.5	3141	53.0	1071	51.0		
Age								
9	4302	53.6	3175	53.6	1127	53.7		
10	3725	46.4	2752	46.4	973	46.3		
Family Marital Status* b								
Other	2488	31.0	1058	17.9	1430	68.1		
Married	5539	69.0	4869	82.1	670	31.9		
	Mean	SD	Mean	SD	Mean	SD		
Household income (1-10) * a	7.43	2.37	8.14	1.72	5.19	2.71		
Exercise frequency (0-7)*	2.85	1.26	2.84	1.22	2.87	1.35		

Table 1. Descriptive data overall and by race (n = 8027).

SD= Standard Deviation;

*p < 0.05 for Black - White comparisons;

a independent sample t test;

b Chi Square test

Table 2. Linear regressions overall (n =8027).

			Model 3 Main Effects	Ì					Model 4 Interaction	s			
beta	b	SE	CI		t	р	beta	b	SE	CI		t	р
0.04	0.12	0.04	0.04	0.20	2.87	.004	0.11	0.33	0.10	0.12	0.53	3.18	.001
0.06	0.14	0.03	0.09	0.20	4.91	.000	0.06	0.14	0.03	0.09	0.20	4.93	.000
0.05	0.13	0.03	0.07	0.19	4.54	.000	0.05	0.13	0.03	0.07	0.19	4.54	.000
0.01	0.03	0.04	-0.05	0.11	0.80	.423	0.01	0.03	0.04	-0.05	0.11	0.74	.457
0.03	0.02	0.01	0.00	0.03	1.93	.053	0.06	0.03	0.01	0.01	0.05	2.89	.004
							-0.07	-0.03	0.01	0.06	0.00	-2.21	.027
	1.37	0.28	0.82	1.91	4.89	.000		1.25	0.28	0.69	1.81	4.40	.000
	beta 0.04 0.06 0.05 0.01 0.03	beta b 0.04 0.12 0.06 0.14 0.05 0.13 0.01 0.03 0.03 0.02 1.37	beta b SE 0.04 0.12 0.04 0.06 0.14 0.03 0.05 0.13 0.03 0.01 0.03 0.04 0.03 0.02 0.01 1.37 0.28	beta b SE Cl 0.04 0.12 0.04 0.04 0.06 0.14 0.03 0.09 0.05 0.13 0.03 0.07 0.01 0.03 0.04 -0.05 1.37 0.28 0.82	beta b SE Cl 0.04 0.12 0.04 0.04 0.20 0.06 0.14 0.03 0.09 0.20 0.05 0.13 0.03 0.07 0.19 0.01 0.03 0.04 -0.05 0.11 0.03 0.02 0.01 0.00 0.03 1.37 0.28 0.82 1.91	Model 3 Main Effects SE Cl t 0.04 0.12 0.04 0.04 0.20 2.87 0.06 0.14 0.03 0.09 0.20 4.91 0.05 0.13 0.03 0.07 0.19 4.54 0.01 0.03 0.04 -0.05 0.11 0.80 0.03 0.02 0.01 0.00 0.03 1.93 0.03 1.37 0.28 0.82 1.91 4.89	Model 3 Main Effects beta b SE Cl t p 0.04 0.12 0.04 0.04 0.20 2.87 .004 0.06 0.14 0.03 0.09 0.20 4.91 .000 0.05 0.13 0.03 0.07 0.19 4.54 .000 0.01 0.03 0.04 -0.05 0.11 0.80 .423 0.03 0.02 0.01 0.00 0.03 1.93 .053 1.37 0.28 0.82 1.91 4.89 .000	Model 3 Main Effects beta b SE Cl t p beta 0.04 0.12 0.04 0.04 0.20 2.87 .004 0.11 0.06 0.14 0.03 0.09 0.20 4.91 .000 0.06 0.05 0.13 0.03 0.07 0.19 4.54 .000 0.05 0.01 0.03 0.04 -0.05 0.11 0.80 .423 0.01 0.03 0.02 0.01 0.00 0.03 1.93 .053 0.06 1.37 0.28 0.82 1.91 4.89 .000 -0.07	Model 3 Main Effects beta b SE Cl t p beta b 0.04 0.12 0.04 0.04 0.20 2.87 .004 0.11 0.33 0.06 0.14 0.03 0.09 0.20 4.91 .000 0.06 0.14 0.05 0.13 0.03 0.07 0.19 4.54 .000 0.05 0.13 0.01 0.03 0.04 -0.05 0.11 0.80 .423 0.01 0.03 0.03 0.02 0.01 0.00 0.03 1.93 .053 0.06 0.03 1.03 0.20 0.01 0.03 1.93 .053 0.06 0.03	Model 3 Main Effects Model 3 Main Effects Model 3 Main Effects beta b SE Cl t p beta b SE 0.04 0.12 0.04 0.04 0.20 2.87 .004 0.11 0.33 0.10 0.06 0.14 0.03 0.09 0.20 4.91 .000 0.06 0.14 0.03 0.05 0.13 0.03 0.07 0.19 4.54 .000 0.05 0.13 0.03 0.04 0.01 0.03 0.04 0.11 0.80 .423 0.01 0.03 0.04 0.03 0.02 0.01 0.03 1.93 .053 0.06 0.03 0.01 0.03 0.02 0.01 0.03 1.93 .053 0.06 0.03 0.01 0.03 0.02 0.03 1.93 .053 0.06 0.03 0.01 0.03 0.02 0.03 1.93 .053 0.06 0.03 0.01 0.03 0.22 <td>Image: Second Secon</td> <td>Model 3 Main Effects Model 3 Main Effects Model 4 Interactions beta b SE Cl t p beta b SE Cl 0.04 0.12 0.04 0.04 0.20 2.87 .004 0.11 0.33 0.10 0.12 0.53 0.06 0.14 0.03 0.09 0.20 4.91 .000 0.06 0.14 0.03 0.09 0.20 0.05 0.13 0.03 0.07 0.19 4.54 .000 0.06 0.14 0.03 0.09 0.20 0.01 0.03 0.04 -0.05 0.11 0.80 .423 0.01 0.03 0.04 -0.05 0.11 0.03 0.02 0.01 0.00 0.03 1.93 .053 0.06 0.03 0.01 0.01 0.05 0.03 0.02 0.01 0.03 1.93 .053 0.06 0.03 0.01 0.06 <t< td=""><td>Image: Here Image: HereImage: Here Image: Here</td></t<></td>	Image: Second Secon	Model 3 Main Effects Model 3 Main Effects Model 4 Interactions beta b SE Cl t p beta b SE Cl 0.04 0.12 0.04 0.04 0.20 2.87 .004 0.11 0.33 0.10 0.12 0.53 0.06 0.14 0.03 0.09 0.20 4.91 .000 0.06 0.14 0.03 0.09 0.20 0.05 0.13 0.03 0.07 0.19 4.54 .000 0.06 0.14 0.03 0.09 0.20 0.01 0.03 0.04 -0.05 0.11 0.80 .423 0.01 0.03 0.04 -0.05 0.11 0.03 0.02 0.01 0.00 0.03 1.93 .053 0.06 0.03 0.01 0.01 0.05 0.03 0.02 0.01 0.03 1.93 .053 0.06 0.03 0.01 0.06 <t< td=""><td>Image: Here Image: HereImage: Here Image: Here</td></t<>	Image: Here Image: HereImage: Here Image: Here

b= Unstandardized Regression Coefficient; CI= Confidence Interval

SE= Standard Error

Table 3. Linear regressions across groups defined by race $(n = 8027)$.														
				Model 3 White						Model 4 Black				
	beta	b	SE	CI		t	р	beta	b	SE	CI		t	р
Sex (Male)	0.05	0.12	0.03	0.06	0.19	3.79	.000	0.08	0.21	0.06	0.08	0.33	3.25	.001
Age	0.06	0.14	0.03	0.08	0.21	4.43	.000	0.03	0.09	0.06	-0.03	0.22	1.48	.140
Marital Status (Married)	0.01	0.02	0.05	-0.07	0.11	0.43	.664	0.02	0.05	0.08	-0.10	0.20	0.67	.504
Household income	0.04	0.03	0.01	0.01	0.05	2.95	.003	-0.01	0.00	0.01	-0.03	0.02	-0.28	.778
Intercept		1.15	0.32	0.53	1.77	3.65	.000		1.91	0.60	0.73	3.09	3.17	.002

b= Unstandardized Regression Coefficient; CI= Confidence Interval SE= Standard Error

[53], asthma [54], obesity [55], anxiety [56], and depression [57]. Similar MDRs are observed for children [54], and adolescents [51,55,58]. Black and White children are not equally protected from their family SES, which is in line with the MDRs.

Research on MDRs suggests that diminished returns are not specific to any specific health or behavioral outcomes. This observation suggests that marginalization and social stratification, which accompanies race, may result in a systemic Black- White differences in the health gain from their SES resources [19,20]. These patterns hold for many visible and nonvisible marginalizing identities such as race [28], ethnicity [35,59,60], sexual orientation [38,40], immigration [61], and even place-based marginalization [29]. That is racism and all forms of marginalization of populations result in a reduced health gain that follows SES.

MDRs have also been reported by Navarro [62-64], Farmer and Ferraro [65], Hamilton and Darity [66], Hudson et al. [67-69], Shapiro and Oliver [70,71], and other scholars [72]. Farmer and Ferraro documented MDRs of education on self-rated health. They showed that Whites gained more than Blacks from an increase in their educational attainment [65]. Shapiro and Oliver have documented the extensive and pervasive inequalities in wealth distribution between Black and White families [70,71]. Hamilton and Darity have described the same type of wealth gap in other studies and reports [66]. Other investigators have also published on MDRs [72]. Hudson et al. have shown a reduced gain of SES in the lives of Black than White adults [67-69]. Navarro has argued that health is not a function of race or SES but race and SES [62-64]. Others have shown that income better reduces discrimination for Whites than Blacks [73].

This study shows that health behaviors of high SES Black children is not optimal. This disadvantage may explain why high SES Black people remain at risk of chronic diseases [54], obesity [55,74], blood pressure [60]. This may also explain why high SES Black people remain at risk of chronic disease [75], hospitalization [31,76], and mortality [77].

MDRs have been explained through multiple mechanisms [19,20]. Structural and environmental inequalities due to social stratification may play a role [19,20]. Highly educated Black people work in worse occupations than highly educated White people [30] and report lower levels physical activity [37], and are at a higher risk of smoke cigarettes[32], drinking [35], and depression [57].

A mechanism that may cause MDRs is the high psychosocial tax that Black families pay in the US for their social mobility status [78]. Black people report higher levels of stress across all mobility statuses, compared to Whites [78]. Simultaneously, highly educated Blacks report more stress associated with race and discrimination [79]. At each level of education, Blacks have less income and wealth than Whites, and we know that income and wealth can buffer stress when they occur [70,71]. While highly educated Whites have lowest risk of poverty, highly educated Black families remain at risk of poverty [80].

Implications

There is a need for policy solutions that can undo health disparities across all SES levels in the United States. Previously, most policies have tried to eliminate racial inequalities in health through increasing minorities' access to resources or reducing their exposure to risk factors. We argue that another type of policy is also needed. Elimination of racial inequalities is not possible unless we equalize the return of SES for all groups. Not only unequal access but also unequal return of resources should be a priority for policymakers. To equalize return of resources, we need to similarly treat all racial and ethnic groups and Blacks and other ethnic groups in the society. Unless we effectively address the observe MDRs, merely promoting SES resources of racial and ethnic minority groups would not be sufficient for elimination of racial health disparities in the US. Thus, understanding MDRs extend our tools on how we can reduce health disparities [81-85].

Future Research

Future research should investigate the differences in the operant mechanisms by which social determinants and SES indicators impact health behaviors of social sub-groups in the US. That means we need to explore differences in the additive and multiplicative effects of race, SES, sex, and place on prohealth behaviors such as physical activity. Exercise frequency is not the only important aspect of health behaviors, and it is not only shaped by parental SES by a wide range of social, interpersonal, and individual factors. While this study only focused on exercise engagement of American children based on their household income and race, literature shows that several other factors may contribute to the physical activity of children. These include attitudes and expectations, availability of green areas and walkability, education in school and family, body mass index and chronic disease, mental health, and other health behaviors of the self as well as family members and peers. While we only studied income, future research should also test if other SES indicators such as parental education, wealth, parental occupation also show similar results. Future studies may also focus on the influences of peers and family members on health behaviors of White and Black children from middle-class families. There is also a need to study how these diminished returns change over time. It is also important to study contextual factors that reduce health behaviors of middle-class Black families. In addition, we need to understand modifiable factors that influence health behaviors in children. Studying mediators and moderators of the interplay between class, race, parenting, and health behaviors such as physical activity may propose intervention plans that can be utilized to undo health inequities across all SES levels. Such research is able to recommend novel and effective plans for action by local and federal government to enhance physical activity practices of the children. Longitudinal data and cohort studies are needed to study trajectories of engagement in physical activity form childhood to adulthood. Such research may go beyond relying on self-reported data and use wearables and meta data that can track individual movements.

Limitations

The study has a few limitations. First, most surveys do not have a balanced sample size of Black and White participants. The sample was also not random. As a result, the results are not generalizable to all White and Black US families. Other risk factors of low exercise frequency such as availability of green areas and physical activity of peers and parents were not measured. Our exercise frequency questionnaire was a simple three-item measure. There was also no information on other related behaviors such as sleep or diet. In addition, in this study, SES was not matched between Black and White participants. White families have higher levels of education and higher household income and are more likely to be married than Black families. In addition, these data are only tested for the differences between White and Black families and should not be generalized to other race and ethnic groups. This study only used 9-10 years old children and other developmental groups of White and Black children may show different patterns. Despite all these limitations are important, none of them are fatal flaws. As such, we need more replication studies on the results reported here.

Conclusion

In a national sample in the U.S, Black and White families show difference in the effect of their household income on children exercise frequency. While for White children, exercise frequency is a function of household income, meaning that and exercise frequency is highest for high income White children, for Blacks, exercise frequency remains always low, regardless of their income level. This new insight may help researchers, clinicians, policymakers, and others to tackle health inequalities in American children.

References

- Assari Shervin. "Protective Effects of Maternal Education against Low Birth Weight Deliveries: Blacks' Diminished Returns." J Res Health Sci 5 (2020):80-94.
- 2. Link, Bruce G and Jo Phelan. "Social conditions as fundamental causes of disease." J Health Soc Beha (1995): 80-94.
- Hussain MA, Noorani S Khan, A Asad and Rehan A, et al. "The Role of Neighborhood Environment in Promoting Risk Factors of Cardiovascular Disease among Young Adults: Data from Middle to High Income Population in an Asian Megacity." *PLoS One* 10(2015):e0124827.
- Estabrooks PA, Bradshaw M, Dzewaltowski D, and Klesges LM. "The reach and adoption of Walk Kansas: Translating research into practice." Ann Behav Med 25 (2003): S049.
- Wee Liang En, Yun Ying Tammy Tsang, Sook Muay Tay, Andre Cheah and Mark Puhaindran et al. "Perceived neighborhood environment and its association with health screening and exercise participation amongst low-income public rental flat residents in Singapore." INT J ENV RES PUB HE16 (2019): 1384.
- Blumenshine Philip, Susan Egerter, Colleen J Barclay and Catherine Cubbin, et al. "Socioeconomic disparities in adverse birth outcomes: a systematic review." Am J Prev Med 39(2010): 263-272.
- Child Stephanie T, Andrew T Kaczynski, Melissa L Fair and Ellen W Stowe, et al. "'We need a safe, walkable way to connect our sisters and brothers': a qualitative study of opportunities and challenges for neighborhood-based physical activity among residents of low-income African-American communities." *Ethn Health* 24 (2019): 353-364.
- Zhang Jun, David A Shoham, Eric Tesdahl and Sabina B Gesell. "Network interventions on physical activity in an afterschool program: An agent-based social network study." *Am J Public Health* 105(2015): S236-243.
- 9. Schultz CL, Wilhelm Stanis, Sayers SA and Thombs SP, et al. "A

longitudinal examination of improved access on park use and physical activity in a low-income and majority African American neighborhood park." *J Prev Med Public Health* 95 (2017): S95-100.

- Bambra Clare L, Frances C Hillier, Helen J Moore and Carolyn D Summerbell. "Tackling inequalities in obesity: a protocol for a systematic review of the effectiveness of public health interventions at reducing socioeconomic inequalities in obesity amongst children." Syst Rev 1(2012): 1-7.
- Samuel Laura J, David L Roth, Brian S Schwartz and Roland J Thorpe, et al. "Socioeconomic status, race/ethnicity, and diurnal cortisol trajectories in middle-aged and older adults." J Gerontol B Psychol Sci Soc Sci 73 (2018): 468-476.
- Ross Catherine E and John Mirowsky. "Refining the association between education and health: the effects of quantity, credential, and selectivity." *Demography* 36 (1999): 445-460.
- Mirowsky John and Catherine E Ross. "Education, health, and the default American lifestyle." J Health Soc Behav 56 (2015): 297-306.
- Campbell Emily E, Jason Gilliland, Paula DN Dworatzek and Barbra De Vrijer, et al. "Socioeconomic status and adverse birth outcomes: A population-based Canadian sample." J Biosoc Sci 50 (2018): 102-113.
- 15. Kothari Catherine L., Rajib Paul, Ben Dormitorio, Fernando Ospina and Arthur James et al. "The interplay of race, socioeconomic status and neighborhood residence upon birth outcomes in a high black infant mortality community." SSM-population health 2 (2016): 859-67.
- Assari Shervin, and Maryam Moghani Lankarani. "Race and urbanity alter the protective effect of education but not income on mortality." *Front. public health*4 (2016): 100.
- 17. Assari Shervin. "The benefits of higher income in protecting against chronic medical conditions are smaller for African Americans than whites." *J Res Health Sci* 6(2018: 2.
- Assari Shervin. "Blacks' diminished return of education attainment on subjective health; mediating effect of income." *Behav Brain Sci* 8 (2018): 176.
- 19. Assari Shervin. "Unequal gain of equal resources across racial groups." Int J Health Policy Manag.7 (2018): 1.
- Assari Shervin. "Health disparities due to diminished return among black Americans: Public policy solutions." Soc Issues Policy Rev 12 (2018): 112-45.
- Assari Shervin. "Social determinants of depression: The intersections of race, gender, and socioeconomic status." Brain Sci 7 (2017): 156.
- Assari Shervin. "Educational attainment and exercise frequency in American women; blacks' diminished returns." J Womens Health 6 (2019).
- Assari Shervin, Shanika Boyce, Mohsen Bazargan and Cleopatra H. Caldwell. "A dream deferred: African American women's diminished socioeconomic returns of postponing childbearing from teenage to adulthood." J Reprod Med 1 (2020): 62-76.
- Assari Shervin, Shanika Boyce, Cleopatra H Caldwell and Mohsen Bazargan, et al. "Family income and gang presence in the neighborhood: Diminished returns of black families." Int J Urban Sci 4(2020): 29.
- 25. Shervin A. "Parental Education and Spanking of American Children: Blacks' Diminished Returns." J Educ Res 8 (2020).
- Assari Shervin, and Mohsen Bazargan. "Unequal associations between educational attainment and occupational stress across racial and ethnic groups." Int J Environ Res Public Health 16(2019): 3539.
- Assari Shervin, Brianna Preiser and Marisa Kelly. "Education and income predict future emotional well-being of whites but not blacks: A ten-year cohort." Brain Sci 8 (2018): 122.

Page 5 of 7

- Assari Shervin, Cleopatra H Caldwell and Mohsen Bazargan. "Association between parental educational attainment and youth outcomes and role of race/ethnicity." JAMA Network Open 2 (2019): e1916018.
- 29. Assari Shervin, Shanika Boyce, Mohsen Bazargan and Cleopatra H Caldwell, et al. "Place-based diminished returns of parental educational attainment on school performance of non-hispanic white youth." *Front Educ* 5(2020):30.
- Assari Shervin and Mohsen Bazargan. "Unequal effects of educational attainment on workplace exposure to second-hand smoke by race and ethnicity; minorities' diminished returns in the National Health Interview Survey (NHIS)." Int J Inn Res 3(2019).
- 31. Assari Shervin, Heather T Schatten, Sarah A Arias and Ivan W Miller, et al. "Higher educational attainment is associated with lower risk of a future suicide attempt among non-hispanic whites but not non-hispanic blacks." J Racial Ethn Health Disparities 6(2019): 1001-1010.
- 32. Assari Shervin, and Ritesh Mistry. "Educational attainment and smoking status in a national sample of American adults; evidence for the blacks' diminished return." Int J Environ Res Public Health 15 (2018): 763.
- Assari Shervin. "Parental educational attainment and mental well-being of college students: diminished returns of Blacks." *Brain Sci* 8 (2018): 193.
- Assari Shervin. "Parental educational attainment and academic performance of American college students; Blacks' diminished returns." J Health Econ 1 (2019): 21.
- Assari Shervin, Mehdi Farokhnia, and Ritesh Mistry. "Education attainment and alcohol binge drinking: diminished returns of Hispanics in Los Angeles." *Behav Sci* 9 (2019): 9.
- Assari Shervin, and Maryam Moghani Lankarani. "Education and alcohol consumption among older Americans; black-white differences." Front Public Health 4 (2016): 67.
- Assari, Shervin, and Maryam Moghani Lankarani. "Educational attainment promotes fruit and vegetable intake for whites but not blacks." J—Multidisciplinary Scientific J 1(2018): 29-41.
- Assari S and Bazargan M. "Educational Attainment and Subjective Health and Well-Being; Diminished Returns of Lesbian, Gay, and Bisexual Individuals." *Behav Sci 9* (2019):90.
- Assari Shervin and Mohsen Bazargan. "Education level and cigarette smoking: diminished returns of lesbian, gay and bisexual individuals." *Behav Sci* 9 (2019): 103.
- 40. Assari Shervin. "Education attainment and obesity: differential returns based on sexual orientation." *Behav Sci* 9 (2019): 16.
- Assari Shervin, Maryam Moghani Lankarani, and Cleopatra Howard Caldwell. "Does discrimination explain high risk of depression among high-income African American men?." *Behav Sci* 8 (2018): 40.
- Research, Alcohol, and Current Reviews Editorial Staff. "NIH's Adolescent Brain Cognitive Development (ABCD) Study." Alcohol research: current reviews 39 (2018): 97.
- Casey BJ, Tariq Cannonier, May I Conley and Alexandra O Cohen, et al. "The adolescent brain cognitive development (ABCD) study: imaging acquisition across 21 sites." *Dev Cogn Neurosci* 32 (2018): 43-54.
- Casey BJ, Tariq Cannonier, May I Conley, Alexandra O Cohen and Deanna M Barch et al. "The adolescent brain cognitive development (ABCD) study: imaging acquisition across 21 sites." *Dev Cog. Neurosci* 32 (2018): 43-54.
- Lisdahl Krista M, Kenneth J Sher, Kevin P Conway and Raul Gonzalez, et al. "Adolescent brain cognitive development (ABCD) study: Overview of substance use assessment methods." *Dev Cogn Neurosci* 32 (2018): 80-96.

- Lisdahl Krista M, Kenneth J Sher, Kevin P Conway and Raul Gonzalez, et al. "Adolescent brain cognitive development (ABCD) study: Overview of substance use assessment methods." *Dev Cogn Neurosci* 32 (2018): 80-96.
- Auchter Allison M, Margie Hernandez Mejia, Charles J Heyser and Paul D Shilling, et al. "A description of the ABCD organizational structure and communication framework." *Dev Cog Neurosci* 32 (2018): 8-15.
- Bodmer Benjamin, Julia Friedrich, Veit Roessner and Christian Beste. "Differences in response inhibition processes between adolescents and adults are modulated by sensory processes." *Dev Cogn Neurosci* 31 (2018): 35-45.
- Hoerster Katherine D, Sarah Campbell, Marketa Dolan and Cynthia A Stappenbeck, et al. "PTSD is associated with poor health behavior and greater Body Mass Index through depression, increasing cardiovascular disease and diabetes risk among US veterans." *Prev Med Rep* 15 (2019): 100930.
- 50. Aiken, Leona S, Stephen G. West, and Raymond R. Reno. *Multiple* regression: Testing and interpreting interactions sage, (1991).
- Assari Shervin, Cleopatra Howard Caldwell, and Ron Mincy. "Family socioeconomic status at birth and youth impulsivity at age 15; Blacks' diminished return." *Children* 5 (2018): 58.
- 52. Assari Shervin. "Family socioeconomic position at birth and school bonding at age 15: Blacks' diminished returns." *Behav Sci* 9 (2019): 26.
- Assari Shervin, and Cleopatra Howard Caldwell. "Family income at birth and risk of attention deficit hyperactivity disorder at age 15: racial differences." *Children* 6(2019): 10.
- 54. Assari Shervin, and Maryam Moghani Lankarani. "Poverty status and childhood asthma in white and black families: National Survey of Children's Health." *Healthcare*, 6(2018).
- Assari Shervin, Alvin Thomas, Cleopatra H. Caldwell, and Ronald B. Mincy. "Blacks' diminished health return of family structure and socioeconomic status; 15 years of follow-up of a national urban sample of youth." J Urban Health 95(2018): 21-35.
- Assari Shervin, Cleopatra Howard Caldwell, and Marc A. Zimmerman. "Family structure and subsequent anxiety symptoms; minorities' diminished return." *Brain Sci.* 8(2018): 97.
- 57. Assari Shervin. "High income protects whites but not African Americans against risk of depression." In *Healthcare* 6(2018): 37.
- Assari Shervin, Cleopatra Howard Caldwell, and Ronald B. Mincy. "Maternal educational attainment at birth promotes future self-rated health of white but not black youth: A 15-year cohort of a national sample." J Clin Med 7 (2018): 93.
- Assari Shervin, and Ritesh Mistry. "Diminished return of employment on ever smoking among hispanic whites in Los Angeles." *Health Equity* 3 (2019): 138-44.
- Assari Shervin. "Socioeconomic determinants of systolic blood pressure; minorities' diminished returns." J Health Econ 1 (2019): 1.
- Assari Shervin. "Income and mental well-being of middle-aged and older Americans: Immigrants' diminished returns." J Travel Med 8(2020): 37.
- Navarro Vicente. "Race or class, or race and class." Int J Health Serv 19(1989): 311-314.
- Navarro Vincente. "Race or class versus race and class: mortality differentials in the United States." *The Lancet* 336 (1990): 1238-40.
- varro Vicente. "Race or class or race and class: growing mortality differentials in the United States." Int J Health Serv 21 (1991): 229-235.
- 65. Farmer Melissa M, and Kenneth F Ferraro. "Are racial disparities in

health conditional on socioeconomic status?." Soc Sci Med 60 (2005): 191-204.

- 66. Hamilton Darrick and William Darity Jr. "Race, Wealth, and Intergenerational Poverty: There will never be a post-racial America if the wealth gap persists." Am J 20 (2009): A10-2.
- Hudson Darrell L, Harold W Neighbors, Arline T Geronimus and James S Jackson. "The relationship between socioeconomic position and depression among a US nationally representative sample of African Americans." 47 (2012): 373-81.
- Hudson Darrell L, Harold W Neighbors, Arline T Geronimus, and James S Jackson. "Racial discrimination, john henryism, and depression among African Americans." J Black Psychol 42(2016): 221-243.
- 69. kers Neil J. "Animal communication: when i'm calling you, will you answer too?." *Current biology* 27 (2017): R713-5.
- 70. .Oliver M, Shapiro T. "Black wealth/white wealth: A new perspective on racial inequality." *Routledge* (2013).
- 71. Oliver ML, Shapiro TM. "Black wealth/white wealth" New York: Routledge(1999).
- 72. Fuller-Rowell, Thomas E, David S Curtis and Stacey N Doan, et al. "Racial disparities in the health benefits of educational attainment: A study of inflammatory trajectories among African American and white adults." *Psychosom Med* 77 (2015): 33-40.
- Ison Kanetha B, Roland J Thorpe Jr, and Thomas A LaVeist. "Dollar for Dollar: Racial and ethnic inequalities in health and health-related outcomes among persons with very high income." *Prev Med* 96 (2017): 149-1453.
- 74. Assari, Shervin. "Family income reduces risk of obesity for white but not black children." *Children* 5 (2018): 73.
- 75. Assari S, Chalian H, Bazargan M. "High Education Level Protects European Americans but Not African Americans Against Chronic Obstructive Pulmonary Disease: National Health Interview Survey." Int J Biomed Eng Clin Sci 5 (2019): 16-23
- 76. Assari Shervin and Mohsen Bazargan. "Minorities' diminished returns of

educational attainment on hospitalization risk: National Health Interview Survey (NHIS)." Health Serv Res 4 (2019): 86.

- 77. Assari Shervin. "Life expectancy gain due to employment status depends on race, gender, education, and their intersections." J Racial Ethn Health Disparities 5 (2018): 375-86.
- Assari Shervin. "Race, intergenerational social mobility and stressful life events." *Behav Sci* 8 (2018): 86.
- Assari, Shervin. "Does school racial composition explain why high income black youth perceive more discrimination? A gender analysis." *Brain* sciences 8(2018): 140.
- Assari S. "Parental Education Better Helps White than Black Families Escape Poverty: National Survey of Children's Health." *Economies* 6(2018): 30.
- Butler Ashley M, and Caryn RR Rodgers. "Developing a policy brief on child mental health disparities to promote strategies for advancing equity among racial/ethnic minority youth." *Ethn Dis* 29 (2019): 421.
- Narla Nirmala P, Maria R Pardo-Crespo, Timothy J Beebe and Jeff Sloann, et al. "Concordance between individual vs. area-level socioeconomic measures in an urban setting." J Health Care Poor Underserved 26 (2015): 1157-1172.
- Bailey Zinzi D, Nancy Krieger, Madina Agénor and Jasmine Graves, et al. "Structural racism and health inequities in the USA: evidence and interventions." *The Lancet* 389 (2017): 1453-1463.
- Bailey Zinzi D, Nancy Krieger, Madina Agénor and Jasmine Graves, et al. "Structural racism and health inequities in the USA: evidence and interventions." *The Lancet* 389 (2017): 1453-63.
- Rodriguez Javier M, John Bound and Arline T Geronimus. "US infant mortality and the President's party." Int J Epidemiol. 43 (2014): 818-826.

How to cite this article: Shervin Assari, Shanika Boyce, Mohsen Bazargan and Cleopatra H Caldwell, "Household Income and Children Exercise Frequency: Blacks' Diminished Returns." *J Interv Gen Cardiol* 5 (2021): 121.